



Occurrence of *Escherichia coli* and coliforms in processed cheese

Sallam, S. S., Salwa A. Aly and Al Banna A.

Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Department of Food Hygiene and Control, Cairo University

Abstract: One hundred and twenty samples of processed cheese representing: 60 samples of processed cheese cubes, 30 samples blocks and 30 samples spread were randomly collected from different super markets in Cairo, Giza, Alexandria and Behira Governorates, Egypt. Collected samples were subjected to Coliform count as well as biochemical and serological identification of the isolated strains. The results reveal the presence of Coliforms, in percentages of 25.8%. On the other hand, *Escherichia coli* (*E. coli*) could be detected in percentages of 2%. Only three isolated of *E. coli* could be serologically identified as *E. coli* O27. The degree of acceptability of the processed cheese samples vs Egyptian standards was determined the economic and public health significance of contamination of processed cheese products was discussed.

Key words: Coliforms, *Escherichia coli* and processed cheese.

Introduction

Cheese is an important integral part of diet consumed in Egypt. It is consumed almost daily in Egypt as an excellent food that contains a wide variety of easily digested nutrients; its important in human nutrition not only in supplying the consumer with a high quality protein but also it is rich in the essential amino acids, high fat% which supplies consumer with essential fatty acids and phospholipids, it also a good source of vitamin A and B₂ as well as higher mineral content specially calcium and phosphorous. The initial idea of processed cheese production was to increase the shelf life of natural cheese and find alternative uses for natural cheese that was difficult to sell^{1,2}.

Processed cheese is one of the most popular foods in all over the world. It is basically melted cheese which is manufactured from a complex mix of ingredients including natural cheese, water, stabilizers, flavorings, emulsifying agents (mostly sodium polyphosphates) and optional agents such as butter or spices, followed by heating of the blend under a partial vacuum with constant agitation until a homogenous product obtained^{3,4}.

For a typical processed cheese production, the principal raw material is semi mature cheese of shorter structure with partially hydrolyzed protein, and the processing markedly changes the structure of the natural cheese and results in the development of new structures in the processed cheese^(5 and 6). Nowadays, Production and consumption of processed cheese increased steadily as large tonnages of natural cheese are converted to processed cheese^{7,8}.

The popularity of processed cheese is due to its numerous end use applications. Processed cheese is one of the leading cheese varieties in the world that is used as an ingredient in various food preparations (food

processing and food servicing establishments). Processed cheese is produced and sold in various forms such as loaves, slices, shreds, blocks or spreads and is used as an ingredients in numerous products. The versatility of processed cheese can be attributed to its unique functional properties, the functional properties of a cheese during all stages of preparation and consumption of the food that would eventually contribute to the taste as well as the aesthetic appeal of the prepared food. The desired functional properties of the processed cheese can be made into two major categories; unmelted texture and melted texture properties. Due to the technological progress in cheese making, process cheese has three sub groups, *pasteurized process cheese*, that is most closely related to the natural cheese; *pasteurized process cheese food* that resembles pasteurized process cheese but cream, milk or other components may be added and *pasteurized process cheese spread*. Both pasteurized process cheese food and spread normally have higher water content, lower fat content and considerably higher carbohydrate content^{9,10,11}. Although processed cheese is considered an important food source, however sometimes it may become unmarketable or even harmful when it is subjected to contamination during its production, handling or storage^{12,13}.

The spoilage organisms may gain entrance to processed cheese as a result post-manufacturing contamination or even due to unhygienic conditions during production. Undesirable microbes that can cause spoilage of processed cheese include coliforms may contaminate the product causing public health hazards as enteropathogenic strains of *Escherichia coli*. Processed cheese was implicated in much food-borne illness^{14,15}.

Coliforms count is used as a hygienic indicator to reflect the general microbiological quality in routine testing of processed cheese, although coliform organisms can be easily destroyed by heat; however they are used as an indicator of heat treatment failure as well as post heat treatment contamination^{16,17,18}. Diarrheogenic *Escherichia coli* can be divided into 5 at least categories based on differences in the pathogenic mechanisms as enteropathogenic, enterotoxigenic, enterohaemorrhagic, enteroinvasive and enteroaggregative *E. coli*. Enterotoxigenic *E. coli* produces either or both heat labile enterotoxin (LT) and heat stable enterotoxins causing food borne outbreaks^{19,20}.

Due the increasing demands, of consumers of all ages, for consumption of processed cheese and as processed cheese is a semi preserved product; which may be contaminated by different types of microorganisms during processing, handling, storage and distribution; resulting in spoilage of the product or may constitute public health hazard^{21,22,23}. Therefore, this study was planned to estimate the Coliform Count (MPN/g.) and isolate and identify coliform strains from all the examined samples.

Material and Methods

One hundred and twenty random samples of locally manufactured processed cheese (sixty cubes, thirty blocks and thirty spread samples) representing 12 different brands were collected from different retailers at Cairo, Giza, Alexandria and Behara Governorates. Collected samples were transferred directly to the laboratory with a minimum of delay to be immediately examined.

Preparation of samples and decimal serial dilution :

Aseptically 11 grams of each sample were emulsified in sterile poly ethylene bag with 99 ml of sterile Sodium citrate 2% solution using stomacher (Lab stomacher 400) for 1-3 minutes to obtain homogenate (1/10 dilution). Tenth fold serial dilutions were prepared by adding one ml of the prepared homogenate to 9 ml of sterile 2% aqueous solution of sodium citrate. All prepared samples were subjected to the following microbiological examinations^{24,25}.

Determination of Coliform Count MPN/g.^{26,27}

1. Determination of presumptive coliform count (MPN/g.)^{28,29}

One ml from each of the previously prepared decimal dilutions was inoculated into a series of 3 fermentation tubes containing lauryl sulphate tryptose broth (Difco™ 22415) supplemented with inverted Durham's tubes for collection of gas. Inoculated tubes, as well as, the control one were incubated at 35°C for 48 hours + 2 hours, and then examined for gas production. From the results obtained, Presumptive MPN / g. was computed.

2. Determination of confirmed coliform count (MPN/g.)³⁰.**3. Identification of isolated coliform strains according to^{31,32}.****3.1. Biochemical examinations of the *E.coli* isolates using API 20E System^{33,34}.****3.2. Biochemical examinations of the isolated *E.coli* using VITEK 2 System according to³⁵.****3.3. Serological typing of *E.coli* strains^{36,37}.****Results and Discussion**

The Coliforms group includes species from the genera *Escherichia*, *Klebsiella*, *Enterobacter* and *Citrobacter*. Coliforms were historically used as indicator microorganisms to serve as a measure of faecal contamination, and thus potentially, of the presence of enteric pathogens in food. Although some coliforms are found in the intestinal tract of man, most are found throughout the environment and of high sanitary significance^{38,39}.

Table (1): Statistical analytical results of examined processed cheese samples based on their Total Coliforms count (CFU/ g.)

Type of Samples	No. of examined samples	Positive samples		Min.	Max.	Mean	S.E.M \pm
		No	%				
Cubes	60	19	31.7%	3	11x10 ²	65.6	7.25
Blocks	30	7	23.3%	4	15	8.12	2.65
Spread	30	5	16.6%	7	2.1x10 ²	72.6	5.21
Total	120	31	25.8%	3	11x10 ²	69.8	6.98

Table (2): Frequency distribution of examined processed cheese samples based on Total coliforms count (CFU/g.)

Intervals	Types of Samples						Total	
	No. of samples	%	No. of samples	%	No. of samples	%	No. of samples	%
<10	49	81.7	27	90	27	90	103	85.8
10- <10 ²	6	10	3	10	3	10	12	10
10 ² - <10 ³	3	5	0	0	0	0	3	2.5
10 ³ - <10 ⁴	2	3.3	0	0	0	0	2	1.7
Total	60	100	30	100	30	100	120	100

As shown in **Table (1)** Coliforms were detected in 31.7%, 23.3% and 16.6 % of the examined processed cheese samples of cubes, blocks and spread, respectively. The total incidence of Coliforms was 25.8%, with a mean value of 56.6 ± 7.25 , 8.12 ± 2.65 and 72.6 ± 5.21 of the examined processed cheese samples of cubes, blocks and spread, respectively, and a total mean value was 69.8 ± 6.98 MPN/g.

Data presented in **Table (2)** show that the highest frequency distribution of Coliform content in the examined processed cheese cubes, blocks and spread lies with the range <10 cfu/g. The obtained results of processed cheese are nearly similar to obtained by⁴⁰. Higher results were recorded by⁽³⁹⁾, while lower results were reported by^{19, 20,29}.

The public health importance of coliform bacteria is it implicated in gastrointestinal illness as gastroenteritis, epidemic diarrhea in children and cases of food poisoning^{17,37}. Contamination of cheese with

Coliforms gives indication of bad hygienic conditions during production, handling, distribution and the possible presence of enteric pathogens^{29,34}.

Counts of Coliform are the traditional indicator of possible faecal contamination, microbial quality and wholesomeness which reflect the hygienic standards adopted in the food operation. A lack of good sanitary practices may result in loss of quality, spoilage or, in some cases, create a health hazard^{11, 13,36}.

Coliforms contamination could be attributed to poor quality ingredients and is considered essentially a plant problem and the presence of any member of the family Enterobacteriaceae is undesirable in pasteurized dairy products, which suggests post – pasteurization contamination^{10,28,31}.

Table (3): Frequency of isolated Enterobacteriaceae strains based on their identification (No. of isolates 144).

Isolated spp		Processed		Processed		Processed		Total	
		No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Citrobacter species	braakii	5	7.3	6	13.3	1	3.3	12	8.4
	freundii	18	26	0	0	4	13.3	22	15.3
	murlinae	2	2.9	0	0	2	6.7	4	2.8
	sedlaki	1	1.5	10	22.2	3	10	14	9.7
Edwardsiella tarda		6	8.7	3	6.7	5	16.7	14	9.7
Enterobacter species	pyrinus	5	7.3	0	0	1	3.3	6	4.2
	sakazakii	0	0	3	6.7	0	0	3	2
Escherichia species	coli	2	2.9	0	0	0	0	2	1.3
	Frequosnii	2	2.9	1	2.2	0	0	3	2
Ewingella Americana		4	5.8	5	11.1	0	0	9	6.3
Klebsilla species	oxytoca	0	0	5	11.1	2	6.7	7	4.9
	pneumoniae	2	2.9	0	0	3	10	5	3.5
Kluyvera species	cryoerse	8	11.6	0	0	0	0	8	5.6
	oscorbat	7	10	0	0	0	0	7	4.9
Providencia species	alcalifaciens	2	2.9	0	0	3	10	5	3.5
	rustigiani	0	0	4	8.9	3	10	7	4.9
	stuarttii	0	0	3	6.7	0	0	3	2
Shigella species	flexnetti	3	4.4	5	11.1	1	3.3	9	6.2
	sonnervi	2	2.9	0	0	2	6.7	4	2.8
Total		69	100	45	100	30	100	144	100

Results presented in **Table (3)** show that biochemical identification of isolated Enterobacteriaceae strains from processed cheese samples reveal that *Citrobacter freundii* was the most common one in a percentage of (15.3%), followed by *Citrobacter sedlak* (9.7%), *Edwardsiella tarda* (9.7%), *Citrobacter braakii* (8.4%), *Ewingella Americana* (6.3%), *Shigella flexnetti* (6.2%), *Kluyvera cryoerse* (5.6%) and (*Citrobacter murlinae*, *Enterobacter pyrinus*, *Enterobacter sakazakii*, *Escherichia coli*, *Escherichia Frequosnii*, *Klebsilla oxytoca*, *Klebsilla pneumoniae*, *Kluyvera oscorbat*, *Providencia alcalifaciens*, *Providencia rustigiani*, *Providencia stuarttii* and *Shigella sonnervi*) could be isolated from the examined processed cheese samples with an incidence ranged from 1.3 % - 4.9 %.

Nearly similar results for Enterobacteriaceae species isolated from examined processed cheese samples were obtained by^{29,37,40}. *Klebsilla penumoniae* it is a world wide spread bacteria that can be responsible for arthritis, meningitis, appendicitis, cystitis and septicemia outbreaks in kids and newborns, but is more frequent responsible for pneumonia and necrotic damage of the lungs, while *Enterobacter* species were incriminated in urinary tract infection and septicemia^{20,33}.

Citrobacter can cause a wide spectrum of infections in humans such as infection in the urinary tract, respiratory tract, wounds, bone, peritoneum, endocardium, meninges, and bloodstream among the various sites of infection, the urinary tract is the most common, followed by the respiratory tract, and skin/ soft tissues^{9,21,39}.

Table (4): Frequency of isolated *E.coli* based on seriological identification.

Species	Number	Percentage (%)
<i>E.coli</i> O27	3	100.00

The isolated *E. coli* strains could be serological identified as (3) *E.coli* O27 **Table (4)**. The results are nearly similar to those obtained by^{24,26} while higher incidence of the isolated *E.coli* obtained by^{33,36,38}. *Escherichia coli* is a bacterium that is present in the gastrointestinal tract of man and dairy animals. Milk collected for human consumption can become contaminated with *E. coli* directly via animal feces or indirectly via contaminated farm and dairy parlor environments, equipment, and workers. While most strains of *E. coli* are harmless commensals, some are able to cause human gastrointestinal disease with mild to severe symptoms that may progress to long-term sequelae or fatal outcomes in high-risk individuals. Also *E. coli* was found to be responsible for cases of cystitis, pyelitis, pyelonephritis as well as appendicitis and peritonitis^{10,16}.

E. coli, *Citrobacter* spp., *Klebsiella pneumoniae* and *Enterobacter* spp. were implicated in gastrointestinal illness as cholera-like syndrome, gastroenteritis, epidemic diarrhea, traveler's diarrhea, cystitis, pyelitis, pyelonephritis, appendicitis, peritonitis, food poisoning, lobar pneumonia and other infections of respiratory tract, meningitis, pyaemia, appendicitis and cystitis, Urinary tract infections and septicemia^{33,35}.

Table (5): Degree of acceptability of examined processed cheese samples vs. Egyptian standards for the presence of Total coliforms and *E.coli*.

Type of samples	Acceptable				Not acceptable			
	Coliforms		<i>E.coli</i>		Coliforms		<i>E.coli</i>	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Cubes	41	68.3%	58	96.7%	19	31.7%	2	3.3%
Blocks	23	76.7%	29	96.7%	7	23.3%	1	3.3%
Spread	25	83.3%	30	100%	5	16.7%	0	0%
Total	89	74.2%	117	97.5%	31	25.8%	3	2.5%

* Critical limit for total Coliforms was 10 CFU/g. and absent for *E.coli*.

On studying the degree of acceptability of the examined processed cheese samples vs. Egyptian Standards for the presence of Total Coliforms and *Escherichia coli*, data presented in **Table (5)** show that 74.2 and 97% of the total examined processed cheese samples were acceptable. Nearly similar findings were reported by^{1,2,40}, while lower findings were obtained by^{11,29,34}.

Conclusion

Contamination of the examined processed cheese samples by Coliforms indicated inferior quality and fecal pollution as well as pathogenic *Escherichia coli* O27 leads to food borne illness. Therefore to safe guard public health hazards strict hygienic measures should be imposed for production, handling and storage.

References

1. Ali MN. Studies on microbiological status of local and imported processed (smoked) cheese J. Egypt Vet. Med. Assoc., 2005, 22 (1): 65-45.
2. Ali M N, Salem GC and Ouf AS. Some microbial studies on processed cheddar cheese in local markets. Alex. J. Vet. Med. Sci., 2006, 24 (1): 49-55.
3. Amin WF. Studies on market processed cheese products. I. Vet. Med., 2007, 11 (4): 566-570.

4. Asamenew TM, Mahendra, PA and Addisalem, HB. Bacteriological study on Coliform organisms from Ethiopian Traditional Cheese West Showa Zone, Ethiopia. *International Journal of Microbiological Res.*, 2012, 3 (2): 188-199.
5. Baranova MS, Burdvam OV and Sabolva, GH.. Microbiological and biochemical characteristics of processed cheese. *Bull. Of the vet. Institute in Pul.*, 2006, 48 (1): 59-62.
6. Dalal, SK. Detection of some food poisoning microorganisms in dairy products. Thesis Fac, of Vet. Med. Alex , Univ . Egypt, 2012.
7. Desmarchelier PH and Fegan NJ. Pathogens in milk *Escherichia coli*. *Encyclopedia of dairy Sciences. J Med. Sci. Int.*, 2011, 22 (4): 60-66.
8. Egyptian Standards, ES. Processed cheese. Processed cheese paste Egyptian organization for standardization and Quality control . part II Egyptian Standard number 2005, 999-2/2005.
9. Elbagory AM, Eid AM, Hammadd AM and Salwa, A D. Prevalence of fungi in locally produced cheese and molecular characterization of isolated toxigenic mold. *Benha veterinary medical Journal.*, 2014, 27 (9): 929 -939.
10. El-Karamani YF. Microbiological evaluation of imported cheese soles in Assiut city. M.VSc thesis , Fac . Vet . Med, Assuit Univ, Egypt., 2008.
11. Eman OM. Quality assessment of processed cheese at local markets. *J. Alex Vet Med.*, 2010, 44 (2): 300-311.
12. Hassen OM and Abdel Rahi AS. Evacuation study to hygienic state of local cheese and compared with processed cheese which product from al Qadisiya dairy factory. *Al Qadisiya J. vet. med. sci.*, 2010, 9 (2): 28-32.
13. Framtico PM, Smith, JH and Buchanan SD. *Escherichia coli*. In: *Food borne Diseases* (Cliver, D. O. and Riemann. H. P. Eds.). 2nd Ed. Academic Press, Elsevier Science., 2012 , 79-100.
14. Graceleah OF, Orallo AN and Esperanza CZ. Microbial analysis of ice cream produced by big scale and small scale manufactures in Metro Manila. *Int. J. Microbiol.*, 2010, 28 (3): 99-103.
15. Guinee TA, Caric, MS and Kalab MR. Pasteurized processed cheese and substitute/Imitation Cheese processed In: fox, P.F, PLH McSweeney and T.P Cogan, (Ed) *Cheese: Chemistry, Physics and Microbiology. Major cheese Groups*. Elsevier Appl. Sci., New York, London., 2011, 329-401.
16. ICMSF, International Committee on Microbiological Specification for Foods. *Microbial ecology of foods. Volume 1 , Factors affecting life and death of microorganisms ; Volume 2, Food commodities .* Orlando, Florida, USA / Academic Press London., 2009, 101-126.
17. Jafar AS and Jalil KZ. A survey on the prevalence of salmonella and coliforms in unpasteurized Iranin cheese using conventional culture method. *J. Vet. Res.*, 2012, 31 (10): 1446-1449.
18. Kaminarides SA, Kalorgrids DG and Massouras TS. Creation and quality characterization of processed cheeses derived mainly from Halloumi cheese. *Lait. J. Vet. Sci. Res.*, 2012, 86 (4): 33-43.
19. Kapoor RA and Metzger MB. *Process Cheese: Scientific and Technological Aspects*. *Compr. Rev. Food Sci. J.*, , 2008 45 (2): 194-214.
20. Karima, AM. Detection of some food safety hazard in milk and some dairy product. M. Sc. Thesis Fac . of Vet Med., Cairo Uni. Egypt., 2012.
21. Kozachinski LL, Cvrtilla ZJ, Hadziosmanovic MS, Majnaric DW and Kukuruzovic BF. Microbiological quality of milk and dairy products *Dairy Sci. Abst.*, , 2010, 53 (7) : 765-748.
22. Kung AA, Hsien TS, Yung CC, Lee, YH, Hwang JH, Wei, CH and Deng FA. Hygienic quality and incidence of histamine-forming lactobacillus species in natural and processed cheese in Taiwan. *Journal of food protect.*, 2005, 49 (2): 700-719.
23. Maged MK. Hygienic Status of milk and some dairy products received at Univ. Hospitals in Kaliobia province. M. Sc. Thesis. Fac. Of Vet. Med., Benha Univ Egypt., 2012.
24. Maria AS. Hygienic Condition of locally Manufactured cheeses . *J Food Nut.*, 2014, 21 (9): 1133-1139.
25. Noriko KH, Obata CM, Akiko AK, and Takao TS. Bacteriological and epidemiological characteristics of Enterotoxigenic *Echerichia coli* isolated in Tokyo, Japan, between 1966 and 2009. *J.Clinical Microbiol.*, 2011, 33 (12): 3348-3351.
26. Nour ED, and El Zubeir, OW. Comparison of microbiological quality of processed and non processed Sudanese white cheese . *Res . J. Microbio.*, 2006, 1 (3): 273-279.
27. Nutting GS, Lomatt, SH and Barbe, FB. Estimation of coliform bacteria in ice cream and dairy products. *J. Applied Microbiol.*, 2009, 47 (4): 223-227.
28. Piska AA. and Stetina AF. Influence of cheese ripening and rate of cooling of the processed cheese mixture on rheological properties of processed cheese. *J Food Eng.*, 2004, 86 (2): 551-555.

29. Ramaswamy KS and Reddy KS. Microbiological standard for processed cheese, *Int. J pharmacy and allied sci.*, 2013, 32 (3): 205-210.
30. Richard, KR. Dairy microbiology hand-book, 3rd ed., Academic Press Londo., 2002, 709-720.
31. Sadek, S M. Grading quality of some locally manufactured milk products. M . V. scthesis, Fac. Vet. Alex. ,Univ. Egypt., 2009.
32. Özdemir SA, Filiz YS and Cihat ÖS. Determination of micrbiological characters of turkish kaymag. cheese packaged in different materials *African J. Microbiol. Res.*, 2010, 4 (9): 716-721.
33. Schär WD and Bosse, HS. Chemical and physicochemical changes in processed cheese and readymade fondue during storage. A review. *Lebensm. Wiss. Tech.*,2015, 35 (1): 15-20.
34. Soncini, GV, Valnegri LD and Marchisio EJ. Research Of the quality of industrial milk and cheese product. *Industri Alimentari, J.*, 2016, 41 (4): 933-936.
35. Suleiman AD, El Haj, HS and Elsiddig MG. Chemical and microbiological evaluation of processed cheese available in Khartoum market, Sudan. *Amer. J. of Food and Nut.*, 2011, 1 (1): 28-33.
36. Wafy, YM. Sanitary improvement of serving milk and dairy products in Assiut University Hospital . Ph.D.V.Sc. thesis , Fac. Vet. Med., Assiut Univ., Egypt., 2013..
37. Osama. MS, Gamal, AI, Nabil FT, Baher AM, Effat KE, Hala M F and Moussa MA. Prevalence of some pathogenic microorganisms in factories Domiati, Feta cheeses and UHT milk in relation to public health sold under market conditions in Cairo., *International Journal of ChemTech Research*, 2012, 6 (5): 2807-2814.
38. Trmčić A1, Chauhan K1, Kent DJ, Ralyea RD, Martin NH, Boor KJ and Wiedmann M. Coliform detection in cheese is associated with specific cheese characteristics, but no association was found with pathogen detection. *J. Dairy Sci.*, 2016, 99 (8): 6105-6120.
39. Giovana VN, Baranceli1 AS, Carlos AO, Carlos HC, Tarsila MC, Mila GS, Livia CM and Novotny EP. Occurrence of Escherichia coli and Coliforms in Minas Cheese Plants from Sao Paulo, Brazil. *J. Adv. Dairy Res.*, 2014, 11 (2): 120- 129.
40. Bahareem OH, El-Shamy HA, Bakr WM and Gomaa NF. Bacteriological quality of some dairy products in Alexandria. *J. Egypt public Health Assoc.*, 2007, 82 (5-6): 491-510.
